Fikrah: Jurnal Ilmu Aqidah dan Studi Keagamaan
issn 2354-6174 eissn 2476-9649
Tersedia online di: journal.uinsuku.ac.id/index.php/fikrah
Volume 13 Nomor 2 2025, (279-298)
DOI: 10.21043/fikrah.v13i2.33880

Religious Authority in the Digital Age: A Critical Discourse Analysis of Islamic Debates on Music in Indonesia

Tsabituddin Al Ghozi
Universitas Islam Negeri Sunan Ampel Surabaya, Indonesia
tsabituddin22@gmail.com

Mukhammad Zamzami
Universitas Islam Negeri Sunan Ampel Surabaya, Indonesia
m.zamzami@uinsa.ac.id

Muhammad Lutfi
Universitas Islam Negerti Sunan Ampel Surabaya, Indonesia
bustanlutfi@gmail.com

Wael Hegazy
University of California of Santa Barbara, United State
wael_hegazy@ucsb.edu

Abstract

The debate over non-religious music in Islam reflects an epistemological polarization in Indonesia's digital space, represented by Yufid TV and Bincang Syariah. Yufid TV based on a literal Salafi interpretation, rejecting music by referring to the Islamic doctrine of the hadith. This study aims to investigate how Islamic authority is negotiated through discourse on non-religious music across two prominent digital platforms, Yufid TV and Bincang Syariah.com.

Methodologically, it employs Norman Fairclough's Critical Discourse Analysis (CDA) to examine the textual, discursive, and socio-cultural dimensions of how both platforms construct, disseminate, and legitimize religious interpretation within the digital public sphere. The findings reveal that Yufid TV constructs a puritan discourse grounded in literalist interpretation, portraying music as a deviation from the purity of Islamic teachings. In contrast, Bincang Syariah adopts a contextual and maqaṣid-oriented approach, framing music as an ethical and cultural expression. Audience responses demonstrate a significant epistemological polarization, reflecting the broader transformation of religious authority from traditional institutions to digital spaces. Academically, this article contributes to contemporary Islamic studies by bridging discourse analysis and digital religion research, highlighting how online media functions as a new arena for ijtihad and the negotiation of religious legitimacy within modern Muslim societies.

Keywords: Islamic authority, Islamic channel, music debate

Abstrak

Perdebatan mengenai musik non-religi dalam Islam mencerminkan polarisasi epistemologis di ruang digital Indonesia, yang diwakili oleh Yufid TV dan Bincang Syariah. Yufid TV yang didasarkan pada tafsir Salafi yang literal, menolak musik dengan merujuk pada hadis al-Bukhārī dan Ibn Mājah. Artikel ini bertujuan untuk menganalisis bagaimana otoritas Islam dinegosiasikan melalui diskursus tentang musik non-religi di dua platform digital terkemuka, Yufid TV dan Bincang Syariah.com. Secara metodologis, penelitian ini menggunakan Analisis Wacana Kritis (AWK) karya Norman Fairclough untuk menganalisis dimensi teksual, diskursif, dan sosio-budaya dalam cara kedua platform tersebut membangun, menyebarkan, dan melegitimasi interpretasi agama di ruang publik digital. Temuan penelitian menunjukkan bahwa Yufid TV membangun diskursus puritan yang didasarkan pada interpretasi literalis, yang menggambarkan musik sebagai deviasi dari autentisitas ajaran Islam, sementara Bincang Syariah mengadopsi pendekatan kontekstual dan berorientasi pada maqāṣid, yang memandang musik sebagai ekspresi etis dan budaya. Respons audiens menunjukkan polarisasi epistemologis yang signifikan, mencerminkan transformasi yang lebih luas dari otoritas agama dari institusi tradisional ke ruang digital. Secara akademis, artikel ini berkontribusi pada studi Islam kontemporer dengan menjembatani analisis diskursus dan penelitian agama digital, menyoroti bagaimana media online berfungsi sebagai arena baru untuk ijtihad dan negosiasi legitimasi agama dalam masyarakat Muslim modern.

Kata kunci: Otoritas keislaman, canel Islam, perdebatan musik

Introduction

The debate over music in Islam, particularly non-religious music, has continued from the classical period to the contemporary era. Early literature indicates that the Qur'an does not contain explicit prohibitions against music, while the hadith of the Prophet present an ambiguous spectrum, with some accounts indicating acceptance, while others are used to legitimize prohibition (Neubauer, 2001). The long history of this debate shows that the law on music

in Islam has never reached a final consensus but continues to be debated, with views ranging from absolute prohibition to conditional acceptance (Tuma, 1996). Great scholars such as Abu Hamid al-Ghazali (d. 1111 AD) even proposed ethical and spiritual conditions for listening to music, emphasizing the transformative function of sound for the soul and the relationship between humans and the Divine (Weinrich, 2019, 2020). Thus, music in Islam is not merely a matter of law but also a spiritual, cultural, and identity phenomenon that is rich in dimensions (Beck, 2023; Salhi, 2013).

In a global context, studies of Islam and music reveal diversity in both practice and reception. Music is present in various expressions, such as 'qawwali' in South Asia, which negotiates sufi spirituality with a diaspora audience (Gaind-Krishnan, 2020, p. 685). African sonic traditions that link local spirituality with orthodox Islam (Dang, 2017, pp. 349–372; Kibbee, 2020, pp. 363–385; Witulski, 2016, pp. 172–190), to the transformation of the Javanese song Ilir-Ilir in Indonesia into a medium of religious expression (Zuhri, 2022, pp. 197–222). These studies show that sonic experiences in Islam are dynamic and constantly renegotiated in relations of power, identity politics, and cultural mediation. Music, therefore, functions not only as an aesthetic art but also as a field of theological, political, and authoritative discourse (Eisenlohr, 2018; Osborne, 2024).

Entering the digital age, debates about non-religious music have become increasingly exposed through online media and social media. The digitization of religion has shifted some of the authority from traditional religious institutions to virtual spaces, where algorithms, content popularity, and audience preferences also determine religious legitimacy (Setiyo et al., 2024, pp. 214–233). In line with this (Campbell, 2011, pp. 64–93), through the concept of networked religion, it emphasizes that the formation of online communities, identity negotiations, and shifts in authority characterize religious practices in the digital realm. Similarly, Gary R. Bunt, through the concept of Cyber Islamic Environments, shows that Islamic authority in the digital age is no longer the monopoly of conventional scholars but has become an open arena where religious texts can be accessed, interpreted, and debated by various actors (Bunt, 2018, pp. 45–60).

Bunt (2003, pp. 11-15) states that the internet and online fatwas open space for non-scholars to interpret religious texts, so conventional authorities are no longer the sole determiners. This perspective, the debate over music in the digital space is not merely a continuation of the classical discourse but also

a reflection of epistemological and authoritative transformations in contemporary Islam. In the Indonesian context, this debate is represented on the YouTube channel Yufid TV and the website Bincang Syariah, which present opposing ideological positions. Yufid TV, rooted in Salafi interpretation, rejects non-religious music with textual arguments and literal references to hadith (Kumolo, 2021, pp. 94–105). Conversely, Bincang Syariah advocates a contextual and moderate approach, citing the views of contemporary scholars such as Quraish Shihab, who considers music to be part of the cultural expression and ethics of modern Muslims (Setiyo et al., 2024, pp. 214–223; Syahridawaty & Qudsy, 2019, pp. 23–36).

This contrast shows how the classic debate about music is being remediated in the digital landscape, while also highlighting the transformation of religious authority in the new media era. Furthermore, studies on the use of religious songs in ISIS propaganda (Pieslak & Lahoud, 2020, pp. 274–299; Velasco-Pufleau, 2021, pp. 233–243) show that even the most Islamic forms of music are laden with ideological content. This article confirms that music is not only debated as a legal object but also exploited as an instrument of political, ideological, and religious identity articulation. Thus, the discourse on contemporary Islamic music must be understood within a broader framework, encompassing power relations, symbolic mediation, and the dynamics of religious authority.

Based on this context, this study critically examines how Yufid TV and Bincang Syariah construct discourse on non-religious music and how this discourse represents the negotiation of religious authority in the digital space. Using Norman Fairclough's Critical Discourse Analysis (CDA) (Fairclough, 2003), this study not only highlights normative arguments but also examines the dynamics of the production, distribution, and reception of musical discourse within the framework of ideology, symbolism, and the digitization of religion. The main contribution of this research is to broaden the understanding of the transformation of Islamic authority in contemporary Indonesia by placing music as an analytical lens to examine the relationship between religious texts, digital media, and religious authority.

Based on the above description, this article aims to answer several critical questions that highlight the construction of religious discourse in the digital space. First, how do the Yufid TV channel and the Bincang Syariah website frame the discourse on non-religious music in Islam? Second, how does this discourse represent forms of negotiation of religious authority amid

the shift in authority from conventional scholars to digital authorities? Third, what ideological, symbolic, and digital mediation factors play a role in shaping the differences in discourse between the two channels? These questions are important because they open up a problematic space to look at normative debates about the law of music and the dynamics of power, symbolic representation, and the transformation of religious authority in the new media ecosystem.

This study uses Norman Fairclough's critical discourse analysis approach to explore the dynamics of non-religious music law representation in two ideologically different social media accounts. The analysis is conducted in three stages, focusing on one hadith used by both parties. First, a textual analysis of diction, vocabulary, and style was conducted on videos to identify potential meaning manipulation or one-sided claims. Second, the discursive practice analysis traced how content was produced and consumed, including visual packaging, argumentative strategies, and patterns of presenting the hadith. Third, social practice analysis aims to reveal the relationship between discourse and the underlying social and ideological structures by examining audience responses in the comment section and how the media responds to its audience. This study aims to map the social construction and discourse opposition that emerged in the digital debate by combining micro-textual and macro-ideological dimensions.

Salafi Orthodoxy vis-à-vis Contextual Islam: Ideological Fragmentation in Indonesian Islamic Digital Media

The transformation of Islamic preaching in the digital age cannot be separated from the ideological dynamics that color Islamic content on various platforms. One representation of textual Islamic preaching is Yufid TV, a digital channel that utilizes audio-visual technology to convey Islamic values. With an educational approach through videos, animations, and lectures, Yufid TV reaches various age groups, including children (Kumolo, 2021). Yufid TV's main focus is on conveying Islamic teachings that are considered authentic by referring directly to the Qur'an and Sunnah and avoiding speculative interpretations. This position is consistent with the Salafi spirit, which is oriented towards purifying Islamic teachings and rejecting bid'ah (innovation in religion) (Soleha & Miski, 2022).

Epistemologically, Salafism is a movement that idealizes the authority of the early generations of Islam (*al-salaf al-salih*) and advocates a literal approach to sacred texts. Salafis emphasize the sanctity of *tawhid* (Islamic monotheism), the importance of correct creed, and a structured approach to da'wah, while firmly rejecting new religious formations that lack explicit foundations in the Qur'an and Sunnah (Setiyo et al., 2024).

This school of thought is articulated in educational institutions and reproduced through digital platforms such as Yufid TV, which conveys these values in a contemporary technological package. The fundamental similarities between Yufid TV and Salafi ideology are reflected in their epistemological preference for nash and their exclusive attitude toward contextual *ijtihad* meaning independent legal reasoning.

The ideological common ground between the two is the rejection of speculative interpretation, emphasis on the authority of earlier scholars, and avoidance of accommodation with modern culture (Misbah, 2019). Thus, despite its use of modern digital media, Yufid TV can be understood as a representational transformation of Salafi ideology in the form of digital da'wah that preserves traditional normative structures.

Yufid TV's *da'wah* strategy displays an authoritative and one-way communicative tendency, where religious narratives are conveyed without significant interpretive interactivity. The purpose of this approach is to maintain the stability of religious messages and avoid fragmentation of meaning. By adhering to the core principles of Salafism, Yufid TV successfully combines Islamic orthodoxy with contemporary media, thereby becoming a channel for Islamic conservatism in the digital age (Soleha & Miski, 2022). In contrast, Bincang Syariah.com presents a more moderate and inclusive ideological spectrum in presenting Islam as a contextual, responsive discourse compatible with Indonesian society's plurality. This media platform was established with the motivation to present an adaptive interpretation of Islam in response to social complexities and contemporary realities, particularly in promoting tolerance among religious and ethnic groups.

The cautious approach in selecting non-provocative content reflects an epistemological ethos that prioritizes social harmony and the stability of religious discourse (Damanhuri, 2022). As an educational resource, Bincang

Syariah.com addresses Islamic issues from various dimensions: from worship practices to current social issues. Its commitment to contemporary scholars' perspectives and a multidisciplinary approach rooted in the Quran, hadith, and classical scholarly traditions demonstrates that the site does not merely convey knowledge but also seeks to internalize Islamic values within the socio-cultural context of modern society (Sumarti, 2010). Its symbolic anti-violence stance supports the creation of a constructive Islamic public space.

The main motivation behind Bincang Syariah.com is to respond to the needs of urban Muslims facing legal, health, and social issues with functional Islamic narratives. Its strategic differentiation lies in this: a contextual approach makes Bincang Syariah.com a reflective space for integrating hadith and Islamic law into daily life practices (Widayaningsih & Helmy, 2021). The goal is not merely to convey dogma but to encourage readers to understand religion as a living tradition that must be continuously reinterpreted in light of changing times.

Specifically, Bincang Syariah.com plays an important role in popularizing an understanding of hadith that does not stop at textual aspects alone but also considers socio-historical dimensions and contemporary needs. This website strives to ground hadith as a source of ethics and virtue within a diverse society. Through this approach, Islamic teachings are not merely formulated as a normative system but also as practical guidelines that are relevant and contributory to the challenges faced by modern Muslims (Bincang Syariah, 2019).

Music in the Perspective of Yufid TV and Bincang Syariah.com: A Critical Analysis of Discourse through Norman Fairclough's Approach

The phenomenon of digital da'wah has created a space for contestation of religious meanings, one of which is through debates surrounding the law of music in Islam. Two media outlets that are the focus of this analysis, Yufid TV and Bincang Syariah.com, provide contrasting narratives on this issue. To deconstruct the structure of meaning, power relations, and ideology behind these narratives, the *Critical Discourse Analysis* (CDA) approach developed by Norman Fairclough is a relevant analytical tool. Fairclough's CDA encompasses three main dimensions: (1)

text analysis, (2) analysis of discursive practices, and (3) analysis of social practices (Fairclough, 1994). These three dimensions enable an in-depth exploration of religious discourse's production, distribution, and consumption in the digital context.

Discursive Practice of Religion Language on Social Media

Discursive practice is a bridge between text and the broader social context. It examines genres, discourses, and styles in a social practice and how texts are socially produced and consumed. The two main dimensions of discursive practice are text production and text consumption. Text production answers why and in what context a piece of content is created, while text consumption explains how that content is packaged, presented, and interpreted. These two dimensions are important for answering how the ideological positions of each account are displayed through language, as well as how specific types of audiences are being targeted through the packaging of text.

Text Production

The video "Kupas Tuntas Hadits Seputar Musik: Bantahan untuk Ustadz Salafi" (May 15, 2024) uploaded by Bincang Syariah.com shows active involvement in the debate between scholars for and against music that began on April 24, 2024. Bincang Syariah explicitly positions itself in this debate, adopting a concise yet argumentative discussion style. However, the video production appears rushed and reactive, which is evident from the minimal description and thumbnail of the video (Bincang Syariah, 2024a).

The video "The Law of Music in Islam: The Most Comprehensive Review!" (December 4, 2020) appears to be designed to address long-standing questions from the public about the law of music in Islam (Bincang Syariah, 2020a). The video is produced with an attractive visual style, clear audio, and a strong argumentative structure, supported by a mapping of legal arguments and analyses by imams of various schools of thought. Released during the 2020 regional election campaign and the implementation of a ban on music concerts, the video reflects the response to the social climate at the time, when people were enjoying music online and virtual concerts were becoming increasingly popular.

The video "The Story of the Prophet Asking Aisha to Invite a Singer to His Daughter's Wedding Reception" (September 27, 2021) was likely produced in response to the viral video of students covering their ears when they heard music. The title and content of the video directly clarify the hadith of Ibn Umar used to justify the santri's behavior while introducing a more liberal perspective on music in hadith (Bincang Syariah, 2021a).

On the other hand, Yufid.TV shows a different production pattern. The video "The Law of Music in Islam and Its Arguments" (April 22, 2020) is compiled from excerpts of a 2014 lecture by Ust. Khalid Basalamah. The reproduction of this video does not represent a response to current issues but rather aims to preserve and disseminate the offline lecture in the digital realm.

The video "The Ruling on Singing Children's Songs" (October 27, 2021) is an excerpt from the same 2014 lecture. Both the text and the narrator consistently present excerpts from the old lecture, rearranged into a sequence on the ruling on music. The video title was not created in response to a viral issue but rather addresses specific questions from the audience regarding the law on singing children's songs (Yufid.TV - Pengajian & Ceramah Islam, 2021a).

The video "Music and Tranquility" (February 11, 2021) is also excerpted from Ust. Ahmad Zainuddin's 2014 lecture. This pattern demonstrates that Yufid.TV does not create content in response to trends or viral discussions but rather repurposes offline lectures into digital clips to expand the reach of its religious outreach (Yufid.TV - Pengajian & Ceramah Islam, 2021b).

Text Consumption

In the video "Kupas Tuntas Hadits Seputar Musik" (A Thorough Discussion of Hadiths About Music), Bincang Syariah.com openly rejects the authority of the hadith sanad used by Salafi scholars. The argument begins by criticizing the methodology of the narrator (especially Hisyam from the Bukhari hadith), which is considered *'munqathi'* because it only mentions "an" in its *sanad* (Bincang Syariah, 2024).

Using the term "problematic," the video's narrative demonstrates the boldness to challenge the authoritative foundation of others. The interpretation of the hadith is accompanied by linguistic analysis of terms such as "*mazamir* (wind instruments)," "*lahwal hadith* (any form of entertainment that misleads or distracts from God)," and the sociological context of music in Arab society.

The video "The Law of Music in Islam: The Most Comprehensive Review!" combines a critical approach to the chain of transmission and the text with a historical-jurisprudential approach (Bincang Syariah, 2020). This video presents a map of differing opinions among the companions and imams of the schools of thought, such as Abu Hanifah, Malik, Shafi'i, and Ahmad, complete with contextual arguments such as the relationship between music, alcohol, and prostitution in the past. With an educational and visually appealing approach, the consumption of text in this video highlights an inclusive and moderate stance toward music.

The video "The Story of the Prophet Asking Aisha..." emphasizes the importance of context when reading hadith. Bincang Syariah refers to the hadith of Ibn Umar about covering one's ears when hearing a flute as a "rejected" hadith and presents counterarguments based on sanad and matan. In contrast, this video highlights the hadith of Aisha and Buraidah, which shows that the Prophet actually gave permission for music to be played at weddings.

On the other hand, Yufid.TV presents a very normative narrative in its video "Hukum Musik dalam Islam Beserta Dalilnya" (The Law of Music in Islam and Its Arguments) (Yufid.TV - Pengajian & Ceramah Islam, 2020a). Verses such as Luqman : 6 and hadiths from Bukhari, Ahmad, and al-Bazzar are read literally and used as the basis for a comprehensive ban on music. There is no contextual or historical reinterpretation. The narrative is kept brief and concise to reinforce the legal doctrine.

The video "The Law on Singing Children's Songs" (Yufid.TV - Pengajian & Ceramah Islam, 2021a) presents a conservative approach despite its seemingly light subject matter. The use of Arabic and textual interpretation indicates that there is no room for compromise, even for children's songs. The narrative reinforces the impression that only the '*duff*' (a type of drum) is permitted, and even that is limited to specific occasions.

The video "Music and Tranquility (Yufid.TV - Pengajian & Ceramah Islam, 2021b) states that music only provides false tranquility. Referring to Surah al-Ra'd: 28, the video's narrative asserts that only dzikrullah can provide true tranquility. In this context, music is considered a cause of negligence that distances humans from Allah.

Social Praxis of Religion Language on Social Media

The level of social praxis, as described in the third stage of Norman Fairclough's Critical Discourse Analysis (CDA) (Fairclough, 2003), emphasizes the relationship between text and the social structure that surrounds it. Discourse is not viewed solely as a linguistic product but as a social practice that both reflects and shapes the dynamics of power, values, and ideology. In this context, audience responses to digital religious content—whether through comments, expressions of agreement (such as "likes"), or other forms of participation—represent the process of internalizing meaning and the ideological positions they occupy.

This interaction becomes crucial for understanding how interpretations of Islamic issues, such as the rules of music in Islam, are brought to life and negotiated in the digital public sphere. Through an analysis of the behavior and orientation of audiences on each platform, it can be identified how texts are consumed passively, interpreted, responded to, and positioned within broader social value frameworks.

Based on observations of the comment section, the audience can be classified into two main groups. The first group supports the content, as seen from expressions of gratitude, statements of agreement, and the sharing of personal experiences that are in line with the message conveyed in the video. The second group shows rejection or criticism, both of the way the material is presented and of the ideological views held by the narration. This group often presents additional arguments based on personal beliefs, enriching the discourse dynamics in the comment section.

Observations of audience interactions in five videos on music law on the YufidTV and Bincang Syariah.com channels reveal diverse dynamics of participation and response patterns. Although the level of comments is relatively low on conservative channels such as YufidTV, the responses that do appear show a rational-critical tendency, especially from audiences outside the core community. Meanwhile, Bincang Syariah.com presents a more open discussion space, with active and reflective participation that combines religious arguments, personal experiences, and criticism of religious authority. This analysis suggests that digital da'wah is not merely a medium for conveying religious law but also an arena for contesting meaning influenced by ideological preferences and audience communication styles.

Video "Hukum Senandung Lagu Anak" (The Law on Singing Children's Songs) – YufidTV

Data as of May 7, 2025, shows that this video has been viewed 27,039 times, received 940 likes, and generated only 41 comments from viewers (Yufid.TV - Pengajian & Ceramah Islam, 2021a). The interaction rate through comments is only 0.15%, which is very low compared to the number of views. However, some comments indicate a tendency toward rational and critical thinking regarding the content presented. This suggests that a small portion of the audience is not merely passively consuming the content but is also engaging in reflective thinking about the ideas presented.

The low volume of interaction can also be interpreted as an indication of the passive nature of YufidTV's audience, who tend to accept the content of the sermons without feeling the need to respond openly. This describes a type of viewer who is loyal, conservative, and respects religious authority as presented literally. Conversely, for external viewers who do not share similar ideological affiliations, YufidTV's normative and dialogue-minimizing approach to preaching can become a barrier to participation. Thus, although this channel consistently reaches its core audience, more open and dialogic social dynamics have not yet fully formed in the comment section, revealing a symbolic boundary between internal and external audiences.

Video "Hukum Musik dalam Islam Beserta Dalilnya" – YufidTV

The video has had 97,601 views, 2,255 likes, and 404 comments, with a comment-to-view ratio of 0.41% (Yufid.TV - Pengajian & Ceramah Islam, 2020). Although supportive comments are not dominant (2.31%), there is a significan number of neutral comments (0.208%) and opposing comments (0.206%), indicating a diverse range of audience responses. This pattern suggests that the video has attracted attention from YufidTV's loyal audience and external viewers who demonstrate reflective and argumentative engagement.

This data confirms that the video has become a meeting point between conservative religious authorities and a critical audience from outside the core community. Comments analyzing the arguments and questioning the video's content indicate that YufidTV's digital preaching-through highly text-centric and ideologically rigid—is not immune to external discourse that is more open to pluralistic religious interpretations.

Video "Kupas Tuntas Hadits Seputar Musik: Bantahan untuk Ustadz Salafi"– Bincang Syariah.com

As of May 7, 2025, this video has been viewed 2,090 times, with 73 likes and 109 comments, 91 of which are from viewers (Bincang Syariah, 2024). The participation rate (4.35%) is relatively high compared to videos from other channels, and the distribution of comments is fairly even: 3.49% supportive, 1.20% opposed, and 3.21% neutral. This indicates that the audience of Bincang Syariah.com is generally reflective and active in discourse interaction.

Most comments demonstrate the use of argumentation based on religious texts, textual analysis, and contextual interpretation, reflecting openness to diverse perspectives. Additionally, the presence of emotional comments based on personal experiences and the defense of identity indicates that the music discourse is not only understood within a legal framework but also touches on the social and existential dimensions of the audience. This makes the comment section a space for dialogic and inclusive discourse exchange, highlighting the distinctive character of Bincang Syariah's audience, who are open to non-literal interpretive approaches.

Video "Hukum Musik Dalam Islam: Ulasan Terlengkap!"– Bincang Syariah.com

This video has received 8,359 views, 244 likes, and 71 comments (Bincang Syariah, 2020). The comment rate is 0.81%, which is high for an Islamic education channel. The dominance of rational and critical comments indicates that Bincang Syariah's audience tends to think analytically, with an approach based on evidence, grammatical rules, and social context. The presence of emotional comments expressing personal experiences also shows that the discourse on music in Islam is not merely positioned in the realm of fatwas but also in narratives of identity and daily religious practices.

The comment section in this video serves as a space for dialogue between normative, critical, and reflective perspectives—indicating the channel's success in fostering a religious discourse responsive to a heterogeneous audience's dynamics.

Video "Kisah Nabi Meminta Aisyah Untuk Mengundang Penyanyi Saat Resepsi Putri Asuhnya" – Bincang Syariah.com

With 554 views, 19 likes (3.25%), and nine comments from viewers (1.24%), this video shows a fairly active level of engagement (Bincang Syariah, 2021). The responses are rational and based on interpretation, reflecting a quality of engagement that prioritizes understanding of the text and context.

Although the number of comments is relatively small, the presence of reflective elements and personal narratives indicates that the issue of music in Islam transcends legal discourse and extends into the realm of religious identity.

The loyal audience of Bincang Syariah demonstrates a tendency toward open-minded and dialogic thinking, while external audiences bring their own ideological perspectives, enriching the discourse. This channel successfully serves as a space that supports diverse interpretations within a healthy and academic debate environment.

The Contextual-Ethical Approach to the Debate on Non-Religious Music

Within the digital age's contested landscape of Islamic thought, debates over non-religious music highlight the epistemological polarization between Yufid TV's Salafi literalism and Bincang Syariah.com's more moderate, contextualist orientation. YufidTV rejects music through a strict, literalist reading of hadiths from al-Bukhari and Ibn Majah, interpreting them as categorical prohibitions on musical instruments. This discourse, framed in sensory and emotive terms, reinforces Salafi authority but simultaneously provokes resistance from critical audiences. Conversely, Bincang Syariah.com employs a *maqaṣid al-sharī'ah* framework combined with a linguistic-contextual methodology, foregrounding music's purpose and its ethical consequences. This aligns with Quraish Shihab's (1996) contention that Islamic prohibitions must be interpreted in light of the broader public good. Velasco-Pufleau (Velasco-Pufleau, 2021) underscores the paradoxes of hardline Salafis who deploy vocal performances as propaganda, suggesting that the real issue lies not in the medium of music itself but in the ideological agenda it conveys. These divergent approaches illustrate the contested dynamics of religious text interpretation within the digital public sphere.

Drawing on Heidi Campbell's frameworks, this phenomenon can be understood as a negotiation between Islamic tradition and digital technology (Campbell & Tsuria, 2010, p. 5). YufidTV employs a framing strategy that transposes offline sermons into digital form without doctrinal change. Thereby consolidating a conservative identity (Campbell, 2010, p. 3). By contrast, Bincang Syariah.com promotes an inclusive reinterpretation of hadith, accommodating cultural sensibilities and fostering audience engagement through critical dialogue, thus constructing a moderate, holistic religious space (Campbell, 2013, p. 16). In *Hashtag Islam*, Gary Bunt situates this discourse

within the broader cyber-Islamic environment reshaping religious authority (Bunt, 2018, p. 32). YufidTV sustains hierarchical authority with imperative narratives and limited audience interaction, whereas Bincang Syariah.com cultivates democratic authority through rational-critical commentary, producing what Bunt (2018, p. 3) terms a pluralistic "Islamic hashtag." Both cases demonstrate digital media's dual potential to enrich or constrain religious dynamics (2018, p. 37).

The study adopts a moderate stance that acknowledges the intricate interplay of text, context, and social reality in contemporary Muslim life, thereby resisting simplistic *halal-haram* means (lawful–unlawful) binaries. As a multifunctional cultural form, music may serve as a medium for *da'wah*, therapy, or spirituality, provided it aligns with Islamic values, as Otterbeck has argued (Otterbeck & Ackfeldt, 2012). Barendregt and Van Zanten note that Indonesian Muslims tend to be adaptive toward music based on context and message (Barendregt & Van Zanten, 2002). Accordingly, this study advocates for ethical selectivity, embracing musical practices that reinforce moral values while rejecting those deemed coercive. Such an approach constitutes a form of cultural *ijtihad*—independent legal reasoning that balances normative teachings and the fluid realities of digital culture, enabling Muslims to sustain Islamic values without lapsing into ahistorical formalism, and ultimately enriching holistic and contextually relevant religious practices in the digital age.

Conclusion

This study aims to examine how Islamic authority is negotiated through discourse on non-religious music in the digital public sphere, highlighting two main representations: Yufid TV and Bincang Syariah.com. Through the application of Norman Fairclough's Critical Discourse Analysis (CDA), this study finds that both platforms are not merely debating the law of music but are actually competing for religious authority and legitimacy in the interpretation of music in the digital context. Yufid TV constructs a puritanical discourse based on literalist interpretation that serves to maintain the authority of traditional scholars and reinforce an exclusive religious identity. Conversely, Bincang Syariah constructs a contextual and maqāṣid-oriented discourse that emphasizes the importance of ethics, culture, and spiritual reflection as the basis for religious judgment.

This paradigm shift demonstrates that the digital space has become a new arena for negotiating Islamic authority, where audiences are not merely recipients of discourse but also interpretive actors who help shape the legitimacy of religion. Thus, this study confirms that the issue of non-religious music is merely a gateway to a broader epistemological issue: the shift in the locus of Islamic authority from traditional institutions to the digital public sphere. Academically, this study contributes to enriching contemporary Islamic studies by showing that religious authority is now constructed through interactions between text, context, and communication technology—a form of cultural *ijtihad,* or independent legal reasoning. that marks the epistemological transformation of Islam in the 21st century.

References

al-ʿAsqalānī, I. Ḥajar. (1960). *Fatḥ al-Bārī: Sharḥ Ṣaḥīḥ al-Bukhārī* (Vol. 13). Dār Al-Maʿrifah.

al-Bayhaqī, A. B. (2003). *Shaʿb al-Īmān* (Vol. 7). al-Dār al-Salafiyyah.

al-Bukhārī, M. b. I. (2002). *Ṣaḥīḥ al-Bukhārī* (Vol. 7). Dār Ibn Kathīr.

al-Ṭabarānī, S. b. A. b. A. (1994). *Al-Muʿjam al-Kabīr* (Vol. 3). Maktabah Ibn Taymiyyah.

Barendregt, B., & Van Zanten, W. (2002). Popular Music in Indonesia since 1998, in Particular Fusion, Indie and Islamic Music on Video Compact Discs and the Internet. *Yearbook for Traditional Music*, *34*, 67. https://doi.org/10.2307/3649190

Beck, G. L. (2023). Shared Religious Soundscapes: Indian Rāga Music in Jewish, Christian, and Islamic Devotion in South Asia. *Religions*, *14*(11), 1406. https://doi.org/10.3390/rel14111406

Bincang Syariah (Director). (2019, March 6). *JANGAN SUUZON!! Ini Dia 4 Karakteristik Islam Nusantara* [Video recording]. https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=t1B8TFxP7s8

Bincang Syariah (Director). (2020a, September 26). *HUKUM MUSIK DALAM ISLAM: Ulasan Terlengkap!* [Video recording]. https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=_WUr-FJflvU

Bincang Syariah (Director). (2020b, September 26). *HUKUM MUSIK DALAM ISLAM: Ulasan Terlengkap!* [Video recording]. https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=_WUr-FJflvU

Bincang Syariah (Director). (2021a, September 27). *Kisah Nabi Meminta Aisyah Untuk Mengundang Penyanyi Saat Resepsi Putri Asuhnya* [Video recording]. https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=pCDcm-CljcY

Bincang Syariah (Director). (2021b, September 27). *KISAH NABI MEMINTA AISYAH UNTUK MENGUNDANG PENYANYI SAAT RESEPSI PUTRI ASUHNYA* [Video

recording]. https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=pCDcm-CljcY

Bincang Syariah (Director). (2024a). *Kupas Tuntas Hadits Seputar Musik: Bantahan untuk Ustadz Salafi* [Video recording]. https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=gzgOQRkQA3g

Bincang Syariah (Director). (2024b). *Kupas Tuntas Hadits Seputar Musik: Bantahan untuk Ustadz Salafi* [Video recording]. https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=gzgOQRkQA3g

Bunt, G. R. (2003). *Islam in the Digital Age: E-Jihad, Online Fatwas and Cyber Islamic Environments*. Pluto Press. https://www.jstor.org/stable/10.2307/j.ctt18fs6ck

Bunt, G. R. (2018). *Hashtag Islam: How Cyber-Islamic Environments are Transforming Religious Authority*. The University of North Carolina Press.

Campbell, H. A. (2010). *When Religion Meets New Media* (0 ed.). Routledge. https://www.taylorfrancis.com/books/9781134272136

Campbell, H. A. (2011). Understanding the Relationship between Religion Online and Offline in a Networked Society. *Journal of the American Academy of Religion*, *80*(1), 64–93. https://doi.org/10.1093/jaarel/lfr074

Campbell, H. A. (2013). *Digital Religion: Understanding Religious Practice in New Media Worlds*. Routledge.

Damanhuri, D. (2022). *Analisis Isi Pesan Dakwah Syariah Pada Website Bincangsyariah.com* [bachelorThesis, Fakultas Dakwah dan Ilmu Komunikasi Universitas Islam Negeri Syarif Hidayatullah Jakarta]. https://repository.uinjkt.ac.id/dspace/handle/123456789/64145

Dang, C. T. N. (2017). Erotics, Poetics, Politics: The Spheres of Action of Senegalese Sufi Voices. *Ethnomusicology Forum*, *26*(3), 349–372. https://doi.org/10.1080/17411912.2018.1426995

Eisenlohr, P. (2018). *Sounding Islam: Voice, Media, and Sonic Atmospheres in an Indian Ocean World* (1st ed.). University of California Press. https://www.jstor.org/stable/10.1525/j.ctv2t4b62

Fairclough, N. (n.d.). *Critical Discourse Analysis*.

Gaind-Krishnan, S. (2020). Qawwali Routes: Notes on a Sufi Music's Transformation in Diaspora. *Religions*, *11*(12), 685. https://doi.org/10.3390/rel11120685

Kibbee, B. (2020). Islam and Music in Africa. In F. Ngom, M. H. Kurfi, & T. Falola (Eds.), *The Palgrave Handbook of Islam in Africa* (pp. 363–385). Springer International Publishing. http://link.springer.com/10.1007/978-3-030-45759-4_19

Kumolo, I. C. (2021a). Strategi Dakwah Program "Bincang Ringan Angkringan" di Yufid TV. *Jurnal Audiens*, *2*(1), 94–105. https://doi.org/10.18196/jas.v2i1.10205

Kumolo, I. C. (2021b). Strategi Dakwah Program "Bincang Ringan Angkringan" di Yufid TV. *Jurnal Audiens*, *2*(1), 94–105. https://doi.org/10.18196/jas.v2i1.10205

Misbah, A. (2019). Kesenangan Dan Otoritas Keagamaan: Sosialisasi Anti-Musik di Instagram. *Jurnal Masyarakat Dan Budaya*, *21*(2), 149–168.

https://doi.org/10.14203/jmb.v21i2.819

Neubauer, E. (2001). Islamic Religious Music. In V. Doubleday (Ed.), *Oxford Music Online*. Oxford University Press. https://www.oxfordmusiconline.com/grovemusic/documentID/omo-9781561592630-e-0000052787

Osborne, L. E. (2024). *Hearing Islam: The Sounds of a Global Religious Tradition* (1st ed.). Routledge. https://www.taylorfrancis.com/books/9781003168775

Otterbeck, J., & Ackfeldt, A. (2012). Music and Islam. *Contemporary Islam*, *6*(3), 227–233. https://doi.org/10.1007/s11562-012-0220-0

Pieslak, J., & Lahoud, N. (2020). The Anashid of the Islamic State: Influence, History, Text, and Sound. *Studies in Conflict & Terrorism*, *43*(4), 274–299. https://doi.org/10.1080/1057610X.2018.1457420

Salhi, K. (Ed.). (2013). *Music, Culture and Identity in the Muslim World* (0 ed.). Routledge. https://www.taylorfrancis.com/books/9781317963103

Setiyo, E., Rosowulan, T., Purwanto, P., & Mustofa, A. (2024). Hukum Musik dalam Islam: Analisis Penafsiran Quraish Shihab dalam Tafsir al-Misbah Al Misbah. *Jurnal Alwatzikhoebillah : Kajian Islam, Pendidikan, Ekonomi, Humaniora*, *10*(1), 214–223. https://doi.org/10.37567/alwatzikhoebillah.v10i1.2613

Soleha, S. & Miski. (2022). Citra Perempuan Salihah Dalam Akun Youtube Yufid.TV: Al-Qur'an, Hadis, Konstruksi, Dan Relevansi. *QOF*, *6*(1), 67–88. https://doi.org/10.30762/qof.v6i1.171

Sumarti, E. (2010). *Analisis Wacana Kritis: Metode Analisis Dalam Perspektif Norman Fairclough*. *2*.

Syahridawaty, S., & Qudsy, S. Z. (2019). The Contestation of Hadith Memes on the Prohibition of Music. *Journal of Hadith Studies*, *2*(1), 23–36.

Translation of معازف into Indonesian, dictionary Arabic Indonesian | Glosbe. (n.d.). Retrieved December 2, 2025, from https://id.glosbe.com/ar/id/%D9%85%D8%B9%D8%A7%D8%B2%D9%81

Tūmā, Ḥabīb Ḥasan. (1996). *The Music of the Arabs* (New expanded ed). Amadeus Press.

Velasco-Pufleau, L. (2021a). Jihadi Anashid, Islamic State Warfare and the Agency of Sound. In D. Siegel & F. Bovenkerk (Eds.), *Crime and Music* (pp. 233–243). Springer. https://hal.science/hal-03048511

Velasco-Pufleau, L. (2021b). Jihadi Anashid, Islamic State Warfare and the Agency of Sound. In D. Siegel & F. Bovenkerk (Eds.), *Crime and Music* (pp. 233–243). Springer International Publishing. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-030-49878-8_12

Weinrich, I. (2019). Sensing Sound: Aesthetic and Religious Experience According to al-Ghazālī. *Entangled Religions*, *10*. https://doi.org/10.46586/er.10.2019.8437

Weinrich, I. (2020). The Materiality of Sound, Mediation, and Practices of Listening: Observations from Historic and Contemporary Muslim Practices. *Entangled*

Religions, *11*(3). https://doi.org/10.46586/er.11.2020.8555

Widayaningsih, R. C., & Helmy, M. I. (2021). The Fiqh Al-Hadith Of Digital Media: The Method Of Hadith Understanding Of The Website Bincangsyariah.com And Its Contribution To The Moderate Islam Discourse. *Jurnal Ushuluddin*, *29*(2), 163–175. https://doi.org/10.24014/jush.v29i2.13954

Witulski, C. (2016). Light Rhythms and Heavy Spirits: Entertaining Listeners through Gnawa Musical and Ritual Adaptations in Morocco. *Ethnomusicology Forum*, *25*(2), 172–190. https://doi.org/10.1080/17411912.2016.1177463

Yufid.TV - Pengajian & Ceramah Islam (Director). (2020a, April 22). *Hukum Musik dalam Islam Beserta Dalilnya — Ustadz Syafiq Riza Basalamah* [Video recording]. https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=eJEza-VNkGk

Yufid.TV - Pengajian & Ceramah Islam (Director). (2020b, April 22). *Hukum Musik dalam Islam Beserta Dalilnya — Ustadz Syafiq Riza Basalamah* [Video recording]. https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=eJEza-VNkGk

Yufid.TV - Pengajian & Ceramah Islam (Director). (2021a). *Hukum Senandung Lagu Anak — Ustadz Syafiq Riza Basalamah, M.A. - 5 Menit yang Menginspirasi* [Video recording]. https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=IP5xjG97va0

Yufid.TV - Pengajian & Ceramah Islam (Director). (2021b). *Hukum Senandung Lagu Anak — Ustadz Syafiq Riza Basalamah, M.A. - 5 Menit yang Menginspirasi* [Video recording]. https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=IP5xjG97va0

Zuhri, S. (2022). Sounding Islam in Contemporary Indonesia: The Transformation of Javanese Tembang. *JOURNAL OF INDONESIAN ISLAM*, *16*(1), 197. https://doi.org/10.15642/JIIS.2022.16.1.197-222

This page intentionally left blank